

**Tooele City Council
Business Meeting Minutes**

Date: Wednesday, April 18, 2018

Time: 7:00 p.m.

Place: Tooele City Hall, Council Chambers
90 North Main Street, Tooele, Utah

City Council Members Present:

Steve Pruden
Brad Pratt
Dave McCall
Scott Wardle
Melodi Gochis

City Employees Present:

Mayor Debra E. Winn
Chief Ron Kirby, Police Department Chief
Roger Baker, City Attorney
Glenn Caldwell, Finance Director
Michelle Pitt, City Recorder
Paul Hansen, City Engineer
Heidi Peterson, Communities That Care Director
Kami Perkins, Human Resources Director
Jami Carter, Library Director
Rachelle Custer, City Planning & Zoning Administrator

Minutes prepared by Amanda Graf

Chairman Pruden called the meeting to order at 7:00 p.m.

1. Pledge of Allegiance

The Pledge of Allegiance was led by Michelle Pitt

2. Roll Call

Scott Wardle, Present
Brad Pratt, Present
Steve Pruden, Present
Dave McCall, Present
Melodi Gochis, Present

3. Mayor's Youth Recognition Awards

Presented by Mayor Winn, Heidi Peterson, and Chief Ron Kirby

Mayor Winn welcomed visitors for the Mayor's Youth Awards and introduced Tooele City Police Chief Ron Kirby and thanked him for his collaboration. Ms. Peterson highlighted Communities That Care Programs including Second Step, QPR, and Guiding Good Choices.

Ms. Peterson, Chief Kirby, and the Mayor then presented the Mayor's Youth Recognition Awards to the following students:

- Jaxson Miner
- Garrett Lawton
- Sydnee Gustin
- Ryan Ascarte

4. Public Comment Period

Chairman Pruden invited comments from the audience.

Jeff Saunders came forward. He expressed his appreciation to the Council for all of their efforts. His wife is concerned about the library; she feels that the book selection is lacking. Books in some of the series are not included in the collection. The Saunders suggested the creation of a County library system that would enable an inter-library loan program.

In addition, he read the Tooele Transcript Bulletin article about the pay for the City Council. He's concerned about the pay for the Council given that it's a part-time position. He feels that \$28,000 is a large salary for a part-time job. He expressed his appreciation to Councilman Wardle for calling him to discuss his salary concerns. He feels the money could go towards pay for City employees or law enforcement. He feels it's the right thing to do when comparing their salaries to other City employees as most of the Council members have other full-time jobs. He also expressed a desire to have a public comment period at the end of the meeting so constituents could speak to the information discussed at the end of the City Council meeting.

Chairman Pruden invited other comments from the audience; there weren't any. Chairman Pruden closed the public comment period.

Chairman Pruden recognized Boy Scout Troop 130 for their attendance to the meeting.

5. Castagno Place Preliminary Plan—A 7.54 Acre 23 Lot Single Family Residential Subdivision Located at Approximately 1090 North 690 East

Presented by Rachelle Custer

This request is a preliminary plat for a 20 lot single-family residential subdivision located at 1090 North 690 East. It does not have access onto 1000 North; the access will be through the neighboring subdivision. The applicant is requesting approval of a preliminary plan in an R 1-8 zoning district. The lots range in size from 10,000 to 13,000 square feet in size. They are in conformance with the City Code. The Planning Commission has forwarded a unanimous favorable recommendation for the project; City staff recommends approval as well.

Chairman Pruden asked the Council if they had any questions or concerns; there weren't any.

Chairman Pruden stated that this lot has been vacant for 20 years; it is a great use for this property.

Council Member Pratt moved to approve the Castagno Place Preliminary Plan. Council Member McCall seconded the motion. The vote was as follows: Council Member McCall, "Aye," Chairman Pruden, "Aye," Council Member Pratt, "Aye," Council Member Wardle, "Aye," Council Member Gochis, "Aye." The motion passed.

6. **Porters Place Subdivision Plat—A 1.43 Acre 3 Lot Residential Subdivision to be located at approximately 630 South Coleman**

Presented by Rachelle Custer

This is a 1.43 acre piece of property in an R 1-7 zoning district. The applicant is requesting to subdivide it into three lots with a minimum of 14,000 square feet per lot to accommodate a duplex. Each duplex will have single-ownership. The Planning Commission has forwarded a unanimous favorable recommendation for the project; City staff recommends approval as well.

Chairman Pruden asked the Council if they had any questions or concerns.

Council Member Pratt asked if they were going to be built each duplex at the same time, or at separate times. Ms. Custer responded that the plan is to build all three duplexes simultaneously.

Chairman Pruden asked the Council if there were any other questions or concerns; there weren't any.

Council Member Gochis moved to approve the Porters Place Subdivision Plat. Council Member McCall seconded the motion. The vote was as follows: Council Member McCall, "Aye," Chairman Pruden, "Aye," Council Member Pratt, "Aye," Council Member Wardle, "Aye," Council Member Gochis, "Aye." The motion passed.

7. **Budget Discussion--Library**

Presented by Jami Carter, Tooele City Library Director

The library is funded out of one fund for their entire operation. The largest portion of the library budget is the budget to pay staff. The librarians are information professionals who are a great asset to the community. Other parts of the budget include content, operations, technology, programs, and professional development.

On average every single person from infant to adult interacts with the library in one way or another 17 times a year. This interaction includes digital interactions when individuals download material. About half of the residents in the City have library cards.

The proposed operations budget includes a \$4,768 increase for seasonal staff support. That budget was cut by 66% for temporary staff last year, which was too much of a cut for their staffing needs.

The proposed budget also includes an increase of \$13,607 for continuation of digital resources and tools. This includes general maintenance contract costs of their digital tools. It also includes two databases that were tried out using grants that were very successful. These databases include full-color downloadable magazines. The databases also include a universal class. Universal Class is a training database where someone can learn something new with support from a live person in an online format. People learn things online in different ways. They might watch a tutorial on YouTube and learn how to do something. The next level is a tutorial covered by another database from the State library that includes more tutorials that have a testing component attached to them. The Universal Class database connects individuals with a professor at a university to learn something new. In addition, the library hosts live classes and book-a-librarian appointments.

The proposed digital resources and tools budget also includes an integrated search database. Previously individuals had to search for materials in three different places; the new system aggregates the physical collection and both major digital collections into one search so the community can see what is available to them. There are between 95,000-100,000 items available for check-out in many different formats at the library.

The library is requesting an additional \$1,941 to upgrade their phone system. They received a hand-me-down phone system from City Hall that is no longer functioning. Ms. Carter received a grant for another project which freed up budget to purchase the system this year; they just need funding for the contract to maintain the phone system. The library is also requesting \$346 for cataloging records.

The library is also requesting an increase of \$8,700 for their collection materials. In the last five years the library has had an increase demand of 550% for electronic books. The library has struggled to keep up with the demand for these items. Ms. Carter has written various grants but the use is outpacing the resources. There are over 1400 holds for digital items with an average wait time of 30 days. In comparison, there are only 400 holds on books in the physical collection.

The library is also requesting an increase of \$1,405 for programs and classes. Last year they had 29,000 attendees at various programs; they ran approximately 820 programs. They need a little bit more money to help keep pace with the program demand. This amount of money would increase the amount by \$0.38 per attendee for programs.

The library also needs an increase in \$7,800 for public access computers. Their system failed several years ago. Instead of requesting a budget for a new system at that time, they wrote a grant to try a new system. However, that is not meeting their needs. The system needs to be replaced. This would be a budget item that could be held off for a bit of time if it's something that couldn't be replaced during this fiscal year.

The library is requesting a decrease in spending in the amount of \$1,630 for professional development. A national conference was held in Utah last year for rural and small libraries that they received funding for during the last fiscal year. This conference won't be held again this year so they don't need the additional funding for it this year.

The library is in need of \$96,846 to replace the carpet in the building. They started discussing getting new carpet and paint four years ago. Since that time a million people have come through the doors. In some areas the carpet is a safety concern. The cost would include the cost of labor to move the shelves, which involves the use of specialized equipment.

Chairman Pruden asked Ms. Carter if the proposed amount for carpet replacement includes bids; she responded in the affirmative. They invited three companies to present bids; only two showed up, and only one was able to do the project with the necessary specialized equipment.

It has been 18 years since the library was built. The cost would be \$0.026 per person to replace the carpet and paint when looking at how many individuals have been in the library over the past 18 years.

The total library operations budget request is \$901,564. The total proposed increase to the library budget is \$36,937. This budget does not include the general cost increases for staffing as Ms. Perkins, the Human Resources Director, manages that aspect of the budget. The total request for capital projects is \$120,291.

Chairman Pruden stated that he attended the library last week. He requested they include in their budget something to help fix the drop-off box area. He requested Ms. Carter look into the cost of the drop-off boxes. Ms. Carter explained that the cost of the box is \$5,000. She explained that they are hoping to get the broken one repaired. Chairman Pruden stated that maybe the Parks and Recreation Department could put some striping in to create a separate lane for the book drop-off.

Chairman Pruden stated that his dad had been on the library board for many years. He goes to the library every two weeks to check out the latest James Patterson book. He's always had a wonderful experience at the library. The staff is very professional and friendly. He appreciates all they do for the community.

Ms. Carter stated that the motto and mission of their staff is to make life happier for the individuals they serve.

Council Member Wardle stated that the online material that is available is wonderful; his commute recently increased and the digital resources have been a great asset for him.

Ms. Carter stated that they welcome feedback from the Community.

Council Member Pratt stated that his mother-in-law used to be the librarian for many years in Tooele. He expressed his appreciation to Ms. Carter for taking the library to a great new level for the Community.

Council Member Gochis stated that the library is the heart of a community. Her mother was the librarian in Grantsville for many years. Council Member Gochis has performed reader's theaters held at the library as well. She expressed her appreciation to Ms. Carter for all of her hard work.

Ms. Carter stated that Council Member Gochis' mom was one of the first librarians she had contact with as part of the mobile library program with the State.

Council Member McCall is on the library board and expressed his appreciation to Ms. Carter, as well as the library board members. He stated that the employees are always cheerful and wonderful to interact with. He asked the library board members to stand and be recognized for their efforts.

8. Budget Discussion—Attorney's Office

Presented by Roger Baker, Tooele City Attorney

Mr. Baker expressed his appreciation to the City for the opportunity he's had to be the Tooele City Attorney for the past 23 years. The City Attorney's budget is less than \$500,000 with less than 12 line items. 96% of the Attorney's budget is for their staff of five which includes three attorneys and two legal support staff. The remaining 4% of their budget is static. The static portion of their budget includes money for professional training to maintain their legal licenses. Mr. Baker also maintains his certification as a certified planner with the American Planning Association. Another part of their budget includes office supplies. Lastly, one of their budget items includes funding for PIMS; this is the state-supplied criminal prosecution database. This database used to be free but now has a cost associated with it.

Chairman Pruden asked the Council if they had any questions or concerns.

Council Member Wardle expressed his appreciation to Mr. Baker for all they do to protect the City.

Chairman Pruden also expressed his appreciation to Mr. Baker for all he does for the City.

9. Budget Discussion—Recorder's Office

Presented by Michelle Pitt, Tooele City Recorder

The Recorder's Office includes the following divisions: business licensing, information systems, and the Communities that Care department.

The City Recorder is a statutory position; state law requires every city and town to have a recorder. The municipal clerk is the oldest of public servants in local government. The profession traces back before Biblical times. The City Recorder is responsible for all records relating to the business of the City. The Tooele City Recorder also serves as the City Election Officer, the Purchasing Agent, the Certified Records Officer, and as a notary public.

The Recorder's Office processes, scan, indexes, and files all paperwork relating to the City. They process paperwork relating to contracts, resolution, ordinances, minutes for the City Council/Planning Commission/North Tooele City Special Service District, agendas, recordings, certificates, deeds, correspondences, oaths of office, claims, appeals, complaints, GRAMA requests, interesting records, and historical records.

The proposed budget includes \$1,700 for training. The training budget includes notary renewals and attendance to the annual Utah Municipal Clerk's Association Conference and attendance to the annual Business License Conference.

The proposed budget also includes \$2,000 for office expenses, which is a lower amount than was requested for the previous fiscal year.

There are 575 commercial businesses, 594 home occupations, 15 food trucks, and 19 door-to-door sales people licensed by the City that the Recorder's Office manages. The Recorder's Office also includes the Deputy Recorder who is a licensed notary public. In addition, the Recorder's Office prepares agendas, notices, City Council packets, and files and posts documents to the State website.

Since the business licensing's budget is part of the Recorder's Office budget there is no specific budget requested for that division. Business licensing brings in revenue through licensing fees. However, the state legislature passed a new law in the 2017 legislative session that home occupations no longer need to pay a licensing fee, which has resulted in an approximate \$24,000 loss in revenue to the City.

The Information Systems department is a division within the Recorder's Office. They work with work stations, telecommunications systems, iPads, keyboards, radios, phones, servers, software, monitors, networks, security systems, client support, licensing, updates, applications, and reports. They assist the employees for the entire City, not just those based at City Hall, with only one full-time employee and one part-time consultant.

The Recorder's Office is requesting a small increase for the travel/training budget for the Information Systems department. The system that stores all of the electronic data has been sold. All information has to be migrated to a new company, which is causing an increase to the operation and maintenance budget.

The Recorder's Office is requesting less money for the wireless communications budget within the Information Systems department. They are requesting an increase for the TecServe consultant; his contract hasn't seen an increase in five years. They are requesting less money in their licensing and office furniture and equipment budgets.

Due to the high demands for tech support from the Information Systems department they are requesting funding for additional part-time employee, an intern, a seasonal employee, or an over-time budget for their current full-time employee.

The Communities that Care department is also part of the Recorder's office. They are committed to the best available prevention research, programs, and practices to create synergy in their goal to help raise healthy and successful youth. The cost-benefit ratio for their services is \$5.31 for every \$1 invested. Tooele County is the only area in the State of Utah to see a decrease in suicide-related risk factors in 2017. In addition, the 30-day use-rates for alcohol, cigarettes, and marijuana have substantially decreased since 1999. They are not requesting any budget increases for the Communities that Care department.

Ms. Pitt expressed needs for City Hall that are not part of the Recorder's Office budget. The phone system needs an upgrade; due to the age of the system they are unable to buy parts for the phones when they break. A new phone system would cost about \$50,000.

In addition, the copy machine is original to the building; a new one would cost \$13,000. The security cameras around the building also need to be replaced, and the City needs a new DVR; this would cost about \$20,000. The projector/sound and video system in the City Council Chambers needs to be replaced as well; this would cost about \$20,000-50,000. There are also general repairs that are needed for City Hall. There are some holes in the walls, parts of the carpet are torn and ripped, and the building needs to be painted.

Council Member Wardle asked if the \$50,000 to replace the phone system would be for all departments in the building; Ms. Pitt responded in the affirmative. Council Member Wardle asked if the City has received bids for new carpet and painting in the building; Ms. Pitt responded that they have not received any bids yet for either of those services.

Council Member McCall asked Ms. Pitt if she could get some bids for new carpet and paint in the building; she responded in the affirmative.

Chairman Pruden asked the Council if they had any other questions or concerns; there weren't any.

10. Budget Discussion—Human Resources

Presented by Kami Perkins, Tooele City Human Resources Director

Ms. Perkins expressed she has worked for the City for 20 years and has really enjoyed serving the community.

The number one asset of the City is their employees. 61% of the budget in the City's general fund goes towards labor costs, which includes the hourly rate-of-pay, over-time, on-call pay, and the benefits that are paid to the employees of the City. 39% of the general fund goes towards equipment, buildings, carpet, phone systems, vehicles, etc.

Ms. Perkins has to wear many different hats as the Human Resources Director, which include maintaining her fiduciary duty to the tax payers, as well as building and maintaining a competent and capable workforce which includes competitive pay and benefits. In addition, she has to balance the interests of her employer, the City, while simultaneously advocating for the employees of the City.

Ms. Perkins completed a salary study and total compensation analysis in January 2018 for the 2019 fiscal year. This data includes market comparison data on any job that are deemed to be reliable benchmarks; this assists the City in determining how their salary rates compare to those of other similar entities. Labor and insurance costs are increasing. The police department has seen a 57% turnover in the past five years. The City has had a very difficult time recruiting and retaining police officers. Part of that challenge is due to salary inflation, Tier 2 benefit implications, and working conditions and caseload.

Council Member Wardle stated that the City is in direct competition with major metropolitan areas. Ms. Perkins responded that there are many individuals who live in Tooele who commute to Salt Lake County to work as police officers.

Many more jobs have been brought to the area, which has increased the talent and local labor market inflation; this is impacting the lowest-paid employees. The big box retailers have increased their minimum wages, which has made it difficult for the City to attract employees for entry-level, temporary, and seasonal jobs. The City starts their minimum wage at \$9.38/hour, whereas many big box retailers have starting wages at \$11-\$12.50/hour.

Health insurance costs have also increased in the past few years. Utilization ratios show the percentage of the money the City pays to the insurance company in comparison to the amount of that money that goes towards the payment of medical claims. The City utilizes PEHP, which is a non-profit insurance company. The utilization ratio in 2012 was 78%, whereas in 2017 it was 140%. The City is not paying enough to cover our medical claims and expenses. Part of this is due to inflation in insurance costs. Some of it is due to changes in the demographics of the workforce. In 2017 PEHP adjusted for reinsurance on claims that are over \$100,000. The first \$100,000 is all that counts against the City's utilization ratios. When the catastrophic claims are removed from the utilization ratio for 2017 it drops from 140% to 98%.

The other challenge facing the Human Resources Department is the 401k plans. The City is currently only matching 1% towards the 401k plans, whereas entities in surrounding areas are matching 401k plans at 3%.

Unlike has been stated in the local newspaper in the past, it has not been 30 years since Tooele City employees have received a pay raise; minimum wages have increased approximately six different times in the past 30 years. The City has had to restructure the pay scale to allow for merit increases for employees. The City went from an average of 3-4% merit increases to 1.5-2% for merit increases. The top of the range of pay was condensed so those merit increases could be put in place.

The Human Resources department is requesting a 2% cost-of-living adjustment for all employees; this number is based on the consumer price index and other relevant statistical data. It is also consistent with the amount approved by the Social Security Administration for 2018 social security payments. All elected officials have requested that they receive no pay increase.

The Human Resources department is requesting funding for two additional police officers. They are also requesting a pay adjustment for the police officers' salaries which would amount to approximately \$130,000. The Tooele City Police Department is competitive up to year five; after that the pay is less competitive. They also want an increased benefit for the Tier 2 police officers. This is funding a 401k benefit for the Tier 2 employees to help make the Police Department more competitive with other local police agencies; this would assist in the retention of police officers.

The Human Resources Department is also requesting an increase in pay for the temporary and seasonal employees. The grades six, seven, and eight employees are paid about 5% below where they need to be paid to remain competitive with other similar entities.

With the scenario presented, every 1% increase in pay equals an approximate \$99,000 increase to the budget. This is because every pay increase includes payment for other factors such as insurance, worker's compensation, disability, pension, unemployment, etc.

The Human Resources department is requesting an increase of \$13,000 to their operating budget. \$6,500 would go towards the purchase of an online application and onboarding system. This would allow people to set up a portfolio online. This would improve the experience for those who are applying for jobs with Tooele City online.

The Human Resources department is also requesting a \$2,000 increase for a second leadership training seminar and/or safety workshop for City employees.

In addition, the Human Resources department is requesting a \$4,500 increase for police officer college loan repayment benefit; this would make it similar to an educational assistance benefit.

The total increase to the Human Resources department budget would be \$13,000.

In a recent poll, 93% of the City workforce believes the City is taking a proactive and high level or appropriate effort towards creating a workplace culture to prevent and address harassment in the workplace.

In the last two years the City has reviewed 14 complaints which have been handled with confidentiality either through staff leaving the organization or targeted trainings such as counseling and correction with involved employees to help address these issues as they arise. It has been over 15 years since a grievance was heard by the employee appeal board. Tooele City promotes a work-life balance which benefits the employees and City. 98% of respondents on exit questionnaires say in general that they would recommend Tooele City as a place to work.

Chairman Pruden asked the Council if there were any questions or comments.

Council Member McCall expressed his appreciation to Ms. Perkins for her hard work.

Council Member Pratt expressed his appreciation to Ms. Perkins for her expertise and hard work on behalf of the Community.

11. Budget Discussion—Finance Department

Presented Glenn Caldwell, Tooele City Finance Director

The finance department has eight full-time employees. They perform all of the general ledger accounting procedures for the City, provide a monthly accounting report for the City Council, Mayor, and department heads, and assist the annual auditing team in providing them the information they need. They also run asset management, take care of accounts payable, in addition to receiving and processing all of the cash payments that the City receives. They have a service tech that maintains the water meters and garbage cans as well.

The total budget for the finance department is \$670,054. 94% of their budget is payroll; 6% of their budget covers operations.

Their operations budget costs include \$300 for membership dues, \$4,300 for travel and training costs, \$3,500 for office expenses, \$3,000 for equipment maintenance needs, \$4000 for special departmental supplies, \$6,000 for bank charges. Last month they collected 3.7 million dollars.

Mr. Caldwell has worked for the City for 40 years and really enjoys his employment with the City.

Council Member McCall commended Mr. Caldwell for his work for the City

Council Member Pratt stated that there was a short period of time when Mr. Caldwell left the City and it was a difficult time without him as he is such a great asset to the City.

Chairman Pruden expressed his appreciation to Mr. Caldwell and his team for all they do to help the City remain fiscally sound. It was very difficult during the Recession; Mayor Dunlavy and Mr. Caldwell helped the City get through that difficult period of time.

12. Budget Discussion—Administration

Presented by Debra Winn, Tooele City Mayor

Part of the administration budget includes the Recorder and the Human Resources departments. The only proposed increase the Administration is requesting is \$1,000 to help improve the City website. Mayor Winn also reiterated that the elected officials will not have a wage increase.

The general government and facilities budget has been decreased by \$65,000 because the electrician has been under the administrative budget, but has been moved to the budget for the Public Works and Community Development department.

The Administration is asking for help with the facilities maintenance budget. The current employee for facilities maintenance, Mr. Meyer, covers three buildings: the library, City Hall, and the Pratt Aquatic Center. They are requesting \$33,000 to pay for contracted services to assist Mr. Meyer with the facilities maintenance such as plumbing, repairing walls, etc.

Mayor Winn stated that as a Council Member she appreciated the staff, but never truly understood the depth and breadth of what they do until she became the Mayor. She is so proud of the City Staff and all they do for the benefit of the City. The employees are a great asset and need to be taken care of.

She expressed her appreciation to the City Staff for their dedication in preparing their budget presentations. She also expressed her appreciation to the City Council for taking the time to work on the budget. This process has allowed the Public to understand what is being done with their money. All of the requests that have been made by the Departments are needed. Mayor Winn also expressed her appreciation to the City Council for their efforts.

Chairman Pruden asked the Council if there were any questions or comments; there weren't any.

13. Minutes

Chairman Pruden asked the Council if there were any comments or questions about the minutes from the City Council meeting dated April 4, 2018; there weren't any.

Council Member Pratt moved to approve the minutes from the City Council meeting dated April 4, 2018. Council Member McCall seconded the motion. The vote was as follows: Council Member McCall, "Aye," Chairman Pruden, "Aye," Council Member Pratt, "Aye," Council Member Wardle, "Aye," Council Member Gochis, "Aye." The motion passed.

14. Invoices

Presented by Michelle Pitt

Ms. Pitt presented an invoice in the amount of \$83,164.50 to the Tooele County Auditor for first quarter dispatch fees.

Council Member Wardle moved to approve the minutes from the invoice. Council Member McCall seconded the motion. The vote was as follows: Council Member McCall, "Aye," Chairman Pruden, "Aye," Council Member Pratt, "Aye," Council Member Wardle, "Aye," Council Member Gochis, "Aye." The motion passed.

15. Adjourn

Council Member Wardle moved to adjourn the meeting and reconvene the City Council work session; Council Member McCall seconded the motion. The vote was as follows: Council Member McCall, "Aye," Chairman Pruden, "Aye," Council Member Pratt, "Aye," Council Member Wardle, "Aye," Council Member Gochis, "Aye." The motion passed.

The meeting adjourned at 8:55 p.m.

The content of the minutes is not intended, nor are they submitted, as a verbatim transcription of the meeting. These minutes are a brief overview of what occurred at the meeting.

Approved this 2nd day of May, 2018

Steve Pruden, Tooele City Council Chair